

09/998,613

OPTP101USB

REMARKS

Claims 1-37 are currently pending in the subject application and are presently under consideration. Claims 15, 17, 31, 32, and 37 have been amended as shown on pp. 5-10 of the Reply. In addition, claim 16 has been withdrawn as indicated on p. 6.

Favorable reconsideration of the subject patent application is respectfully requested in view of the comments and amendments herein.

I. Rejection of Claims 15-34 and 37 Under 35 U.S.C. §102(e)

Claims 15-34 and 37 stand rejected under 35 U.S.C. §102(e) as being anticipated by U.S. Patent No. 6,119,149 issued to Notani (hereinafter Notani '149). It is respectfully submitted that this rejection should be withdrawn for at least the following reasons. Notani does not teach or suggest each and every limitation of applicants' claimed invention.

For a prior art reference to anticipate, 35 U.S.C. §102 requires that "each and every element as set forth in the claim is found, either expressly or inherently described, in a single prior art reference." *In re Robertson*, 169 F.3d 743, 745, 49 USPQ2d 1949, 1950 (Fed. Cir. 1999) (quoting *Verdegaal Bros., Inc. v. Union Oil Co.*, 814 F.2d 628, 631, 2 USPQ2d 1051, 1053 (Fed. Cir. 1987)).

Independent claims 15, 31, 32, 33, and 37 recite *a supply chain data store further adapted to facilitate establishing one or more relationships between a first supply chain data item originating from a first supply chain member and one or more second supply chain data items originating from one or more second supply chain members*. This provides a means for relating data items within a single data store received from multiple supply chain members. Notani does not teach this aspect of the subject claims. Rather Notani describes receiving data items from multiple supply chain members and performing actions on the data based upon a workflow design. The workflow may show linkages between supply chain members, but Notani does not describe relating data items from multiple supply chain members within the data store.

Claim 16 has been withdrawn.

09/998,613

OPTP101USB

Claim 17 recites *the supply chain data store is further adapted to facilitate establishing an ownership identifier for supply chain data items*. The applicants claimed invention describes establishing ownership of the data within the data store. Notani does not teach this aspect of the subject claim. Rather, Notani describes communication security in the form of public key encryption over a secured socket layer and data access in the form of a hierarchical permissibility model. These relate to securing data communications and access, not establishing data ownership.

Claim 20 recites *the data acceptor is further adapted to validate the transformed supply chain data*. The applicant's claimed invention is able to perform a validation on the data after it has been transformed on parameters such as accuracy, authenticity, and corruption. Notani does not teach this aspect of the subject claim. Rather, Notani describes a method of strong typing on data communications to guarantee that the correct data object type is *sent* in a workflow. As described by Notani, this is strictly validating the data type when a message is sent. It does not validate on the parameters described above after a transformation has occurred when data is received as in the subject claim.

In view of at least the above, it is respectfully submitted that Notani does not teach or suggest applicants' claimed invention as recited in independent claims 15, 31-33, and 37 (and claims 17-30, and 34 which respectively depend there from). Accordingly, withdrawal of this rejection is respectfully requested.

09/998,613

OPTP101USB

CONCLUSION

The present application is believed to be in condition for allowance in view of the above comments and amendments. A prompt action to such end is earnestly solicited.

In the event any fees are due in connection with this document, the Commissioner is authorized to charge those fees to Deposit Account No. 50-1063.

Should the Examiner believe a telephone interview would be helpful to expedite favorable prosecution, the Examiner is invited to contact applicants' undersigned representative at the telephone number below.

Respectfully submitted,

AMIN & TUROCY, LLP



Himanshu S. Amin
Reg. No. 40,894

AMIN & TUROCY, LLP
24TH Floor, National City Center
1900 E. 9TH Street
Cleveland, Ohio 44114
Telephone (216) 696-8730
Facsimile (216) 696-8731